中医药国际发展形势与我们的任务

世界中联副秘书长 黄建银

中医药国际发展经历了三个主要历史阶段:中国的中医药、亚洲的中医药和世界的中医药。中国作为中医药的发源地,经过三十多年的改革开放,逐步成为国际上重要的新兴经济体,对未来国际经济发展和经济秩序的影响越来越大。中医药伴随着中国经济的崛起,进一步走向世界,现在中医药已成为世界的中医药,但中医药国际发展过程中依然面临中诸多问题,机遇与挑战并存,推动中医药国际发展任重道远。

国际体制与规则决定着中医药国际发展的现状和未来。对中医药国际发展的分析研究,需要关注三个方面的问题:第一,研究具体的与中医药相关的国际组织与中国及其与中医药事业的关系;第二,研究与中医药相关的国际组织及其体制与规则与中医药国际发展的互动关系;第三、研究中国作为中医药发源地如何组织中医药国际交流与合作,引领中医药国际发展的世界秩序。世界中联作为总部设在中国的国际学术组织,这是我们长期的工作任务。

一、中医药发展国际形势分析(SWOT)

对于当前中医药国际发展形势,可以从有利条件与发展机遇、不利因素和面临挑战等方面来分析。

(一) 有利条件与发展机遇

- 1、世界卫生组织及一些国家政府高度重视传统医药,推动了以中医药为代表的传统医药的发展。2010年,世界卫生组织(WHO)首次将中医药为代表的传统医药纳入国际疾病分类(ICD-11),为了实现"人人享有卫生保健"的目标应当推广使用传统医药,从而给以中医药为代表的传统医药带来了广阔的发展前景。"中医针灸"已列入"人类非物质文化遗产代表作名录",《本草纲目》和《黄帝内经》已列入"世界记忆名录",联合国教科文组织认证世界中联为非物质文化遗产的咨询机构;2009年9月国际标准化组织(ISO/TMB)南非开普敦会议决定建立中医技术委员会。中医药正处在进一步走向世界的战略机遇期。
 - 2、 中医药文化传播与中医药教育蓬勃发展, 为中医药国际发展奠定了基础。

中国中医药大学以不同的形式与世界其他国家的文化教育机构和医疗机构进**行交流合作。据不完全统计,中医药来华留学生一直居自然科学留学人数的前**列。2004年至2010年,获得中医药学士学位外国留学生1万多人,在大陆获得硕士和博士学位各达1000人。中医教育开始进入海外正规学历教育体系,并呈现本土化发展趋势。

- 3、**国际中医药从业队伍不断扩大,行业自律与规范管理日益增强**。世界各地与中医药相关的机构包括各种中医药学会、协会、公会、总会、学院、研究所、大学等,行业机构的建立有力地促进了中医药国际传播。今年来,一些国家正在计划以不同方式筹建中医医疗机构。
- **4、科研合作、学术交流活跃,提升了中医药国际发展水平**。中医药以中医针灸率先走向世界,针对中医针灸服务的科学研究目前成为国际关注的重点。除中国政府投入大量资金设立科研专项,开展中医药基础理论和临床研究外,一些国家与中国成立联合实验室,国际上很多国家如美国、德国等国家不断在加强对中医药等传统医学的科学研究,科研成果丰硕,中医药 SCI 研究论文数量不断增加。
- 5、中医药国际贸易持续增长,服务贸易成为新的经济增长点。中药国际贸易从一个侧面反映中医药国际发展状况。以中国为例,中药出口国际贸易从 1996 年中药向全球出口总额为 6.85 亿美元,到 2012 年,中药出口达到了 23 亿美元。中药国际需求不断扩大,出口贸易持续增长。2012 年 4 月 26 日,中国国务院发布了由中国商务部、国家中医药管理局等14 个部委联合签署的《关于发展中医药服务贸易的若干意见》,中医药服务贸易成为推动中医药国际发展的新模式。

(二)不利因素与面临挑战

- 1、 **文化差异导致的政策管制和市场准入壁垒较多。**西方国家目前只能够接受中医针灸,有些国家依然不承认中医师资格,如意大利不允许中医从事针灸,只允许西医进行针灸治疗。中医药大学的毕业文凭在一些国家依然得不到承认,毕业生就业困难,将会直接影响中医药教育的发展。
- 2、 中医药国际从业人员素质和水平良莠不齐。一些人没有中医师资格,打着中医的牌子从事中医服务,曾经引起过多起医疗事故,国际影响恶劣,而这些事件又成为一些专家和学术组织攻击中医的例证,严重毁坏了中医药的品牌形象。规范中医国际从业准入和提高从业者的素质、服务能力、学术水平,是中医药国际发展面临的挑战之一。
- 3、中医药作为医学科学的国际地位尚未得到认可,作为补充与替代医学也不时受到一些国家学术界的质疑和否定。2012 年初,澳大利亚医学杂志发表题为"高等教育机构不应开设伪医学课程"一文,为推动澳高等院校取消补充医学相关课程和学位进一步造势。四百多名西医医生、医学研究人员和科学家组成一个强有力的游说团体,向澳大利亚部分大学施压,促使它们取消替代医学课程,停止提供相关学位。《今日美国》刊登了一篇题为:替代医学-神奇魔法还是江湖骗子?文章讲述了美国费城一个12岁女孩因长期服用多种营养补充剂(保健品)而导致患上了急性胰腺炎,认为以中草药为代表的保健品打着"天然绿色"旗号,并非有益无害、效果显著,替代疗法是在利用人们天真地相信一切自然之道的常见情绪。
- 4、中药产品国际贸易结构依然不合理,以原料贸易为主。中成药的贸易规模,可以从一个侧面反映中医国际发展的规模,所以,从某种程度上说,中成药出口情况可以看作是中药国际发展进程的风向标。以中国为例,2011年中药出口额最大的商品仍为植物提取物,出口额为11.3亿美元,占比达48.5%;中药材及饮片出口额为7.7亿美元,占比33%,位居第二;中成药出口额为2.3亿美元,占比仅为9.9%。
- 5、 **国际市场准入缺乏可以利用的中医药国际标准。**无论在世界贸易组织(WTO)多边贸易体制与规则还是各国利用自由贸易区(FTA)的双边贸易机制,开展中医药国内规制和市场准入谈判,目前还没有可以利用的中医药国际标准,国际标准的缺失成为中医药国际发展的主要挑战。

二、中医药国际发展的趋势与展望

中医药的国际传播是大势所趋,中医必将大踏步走向世界。这是因为:

- 第一, 和平与发展是当今世界的主流,各国致力于发展经济,提高人民生活水平,健康需求日益增加,发展医药产业,提高医疗保健水平是各国政府的必然选择。
- 第二, 随着健康观念和医学模式的转变,中医药的整体思维、辨证论治、"治未病"等核心思想,正逐步得到国际社会的认可和接受,近年来,中医药在重大疾病防治方面的特色和优势作用正被越来越多的国家和地区所认识,中医国际服务需求不断增多。
- 第三, 从卫生经济学的角度看,中医药具有一系列优势:具有"绿色天然"生态学优势, 具有养生、"治未病"的预防学优势,具有防止重大疾病和传染病的优势,对于慢性疾病具有 不可替代的比较优势,具有"简便验廉"的经济学优势,欧美国家高福利制度,医药费用不堪 重负,沉重的医疗负担,使之重视从中医药中寻求出路。
- 第四, 世界人口老年化趋势,给中医药带来了发展机遇。中医药学在数千年的发展过程中,在老年人养生、保健、康复及疾病预防方面积累了丰富的经验,获得了良好的临床效果;并且在现代科学技术的辅助下,中医药在老年医学方面获得了瞩目的成果,得到了国际老年医学界的认可。
- 第五, 工业大发展、现代疑难病、药源性疾病、化学合成药的毒副作用、现代医学的局限性,给以天然药、复杂干扰为特点的中医药学发展提供机遇。

三、世界中联未来的工作目标与任务

世界中联未来十年的发展目标可分为近期发展目标和远期发展目标。 在未来 5-10 年内进一步夯实和发展已有的组织基础、学术品牌、业务渠道,不断提升服务能力和国际影响力,将世界中联建设成为国际上学术地位最高、规模最大、最具影响力的中医药国际学术组织,为中医药国际发展做出更多贡献。

由于经济全球化与信息技术革命相结合,给世界经济社会带来了一系列深刻的变化,最大的变化是全球产业价值链的形成。中医药国际发展同样需要准确把握全球产业分工的趋势,制定正确的发展战略,积极参与国际非政府组织的全球化分工,努力将世界中联建设成为全球有影响力的国际非政府组织(NGO)。为了实现世界中联的发展目标,未来十年的工作任务将主要围绕世界中联发展规划推进如下几个方面的工作:

- 1、继续夯实中医药在国际上作为医学科学的学术地位,进一步推动中医药进入各国医疗卫生体系。首先,要继续巩固与加强同国际组织和各国政府的交流合作的联系与合作,其次,积极主动地通各国会员一起加强与各国政府的联系、沟通与合作,逐步建立同各国政府交流合作对话机制,同时,积极与国际知名的与中医药国际发展相关的非政府组织(如WWF、TRAFFIC、IUCN等)以及一些医学机构建立工作联系,开展项目合作,为中医药国际发展争取更多的支持者。
- 2、加强组织建设,开展教育培训,不断提升国际中医药服务能力。在加强对现有的 61 个国家和地区的 234 个会员团体的业务联系与合作的基础上,通过进一步开展教育培训、推广中医药实用技术,水平考试、名师带高徒,中医高级职称评审等,培养一批高素质中医人才,推动中医药学科分化,发挥中医药防治专科专病的优势和特色,不断提升各国会员的业务素质和服务能力。同时,大力支持各国会员单位开展不同形式的中医药教育,合作开办正规中医药学历教育,举办各种类型的学分制中医特色培训班,为各国民众提供高质量中医医疗服务。
- **3、积极推进高水平中医药国际科技合作,进一步促进中医药国际学术交流。**鼓励各国会员所在的科研机构、大学和制药企业与中国相应的单位开展国际科技合作,加强对中医药基础理论和临床实践的合作研究,不断增强国际中医药创新能力。世界中联将继续加强三级国际学术会议交流平台的品牌建设,提高国际学术会议的学术引领能力、学术质量和水平、办会能力,不断加强品牌建设,提升国际影响力。
- 4、 积极推动中医药国际标准建设,促进中医药产品与服务贸易发展。世界中联将在已制定的 10 个国际组织标准的基础上,进一步加强标准制定、普及、推广和应用,积极与各国政府和与中医药相关的机构沟通协调,努力利用国际标准化组织(ISO)平台,发布推广世界中联的国际标准;努力与其它国家组织合作,推广使用世界中联的国际标准。鼓励各国会员积极参与中药的国际注册,成立"中医药服务贸易专业委员会",加强对中医药服务贸易的战略研究和市场调研,促进中医药国际贸易持续健康发展。
- 5、继续大力推动中医药文化国际传播,提升中国传统文化的软实力。进一步提高《世界中医药》杂志及各国会员单位的专业性杂志的办刊质量和水平,推动中医药杂志多语种出版发行,提升杂志的国际影响力;进一步完善世界中联及各国会员单位各个网站建设,继续推进各个会员单位与中国中央电视台国际频道的合作,完成《中医药走向世界》大型电视纪录片在世界各国的摄制;继续加强与联合国教科文组织在非物质文化遗产咨询方面的合作,积极参与联合国教科文组织的相关活动;结合世界中医药大会,在有条件的会员国家,举办中医药文化巡展和巡回科普宣传的活动。进一步挖掘中医药文化内涵,提升中医药文化的软实力。

总之,为了实现世界中联的长远发展目标,世界中联将以博大精深的中医药文化为依托, 以服务人类健康幸福为目标,在不断努力提升中医服务能力、服务质量和水平的基础上,还 要进一步深入挖掘中医药文化的经济、社会、人文价值和普世价值,充分借鉴国际非政府组织运营管理经验,找准自己的优势和定位,积极参与非政府组织的全球化分工,提升自身在国际事务中的行动能力,致力于人类健康事业等公共议题的研究,高举"天然绿色"、"环境保护"和"生态文明"的旗帜,倡导"天人合一"、"道法自然"、"以人为本"、"平衡和谐"的健康理念和生活态度,传播和提升中医文化的软实力,不断拓展自己的发展空间,逐步将世界中联建设成为世界上有影响力的非政府组织,为中医药的国际发展,为人类健康幸福做出更多贡献。

International Situation of TCM and Our Missions

Huang Jianyin, vice secretary-general of WFCMS

The internationalization of traditional Chinese medicine (TCM) has gone through three stages: TCM of China, TCM of Asia, and TCM of the world. With more than 30-years' opening up and reform, China, the origin of TCM, is becoming an increasingly important emerging economy in the international arena with greater global influence on international economic development and economic order. As Chinese economy rises and goes more global, TCM of China is becoming TCM of the world. However, problems still exist. That opportunities and challenges come hand in hand makes it a long way to go for the internationalization of TCM.

The international systems and regulations determine the present and future of the international development of TCM. Attentions should be paid to three aspects when it comes to the internationalization of TCM: first of all, the relation between TCM-related international organizations and China as well as the course of TCM; secondly, the interaction between TCM-related international organizations, systems, rules and regulations and the international expansion of TCM; thirdly, the way in which China, the origin of TCM, will organize international exchange and cooperation activities and how it will lead the international order for TCM's internationalization. As an international academic institution headquartered in China, World Federation of Chinese Medicine Societies (WFCMS) will take the above aspects as our long-term task.

1. SWOT Analysis of International Situation of TCM Development

Based on the current situation of the internationalization of TCM, we can make an analysis on strengths (S), weaknesses (W), opportunities (O) and threats (T), i.e. SWOT analysis.

1.1 Strengths and opportunities

1.1.1 World Health Organization (WHO) and governments from other countries attach great importance to traditional medicine, which promotes the development of TCM. In 2010, for the first time in history, WHO enlisted the representative of traditional medicine, TCM, into ICD-11 for the realization of the goal that "everyone has the right to health care" to promote the use of traditional medicine, thus creating a promising prospect for the development of traditional medicine represented by TCM. "Chinese medical acupuncture" has been included in the "List of Representatives of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Human Beings"; Compendium of Materia Medica and The Inner Canon of Huangdi are listed on UNESCO's Memory of the World Register; UNESCO has granted WFCMS as an consulting institution for intangible cultural heritages; a decision of building a TCM technical committee was made on the Capetown Conference, held by ISO/TMB in September 2009. TCM is embracing strategic opportunities.

1.1.2 The flourishing of TCM education and its cultural dissemination have laid a foundation for its internationalization.

TCM universities and colleges have held various exchanging and cooperative activities with cultural and educational organizations and medical institutions from other countries. Statistics have shown that the number of foreign students who study TCM in China ranks high on the chart of the overall number of students who are studying natural sciences. From 2004 to 2010, more than 10,000 foreign students acquired bachelor's degrees in TCM and 1,000 graduates acquired master or doctor degrees respectively. TCM has penetrated into regular academic education in foreign countries and been being localized.

- **1.1.3** More people take professions concerning TCM, while disciplines and regulations are being strengthened. Different associations, institutions, academies, consortia and colleges related to TCM throughout the world have promoted the internationalization of TCM to a large extent. Since the beginning of this year, a few countries have been making plans on building TCM medical organizations.
- **1.1.4 Scientific and research cooperation and academic exchanges have enhanced the level of internationalization.** With TCM acupuncture going global, scientific researches on acupuncture has become an international focus. Apart from Chinese government allocating large amount of money on scientific and research projects of acupuncture, conducting fundamental theoretical and clinical researches, some other countries have built up joint laboratories with China. Countries such as America and Germany are making more effort in the scientific researches on traditional medicine, with TCM as its symbol, and have yield fruitful results with an

increasing number of papers and thesis published on SCI.

1.1.5 International trade on TCM continues to grow, making TCM service in trade a new economic growth point. The international trade of TCM can reflect its internationalization situation. Take China as an example, the TCM export volume has surged to 2.3 billion dollars in 2012 from 685 million in 1996. With demand rising, export will continue to grow. On April 26, 2012, Guidance on Developing TCM Service and Trade, announced by the State Council and signed by the Ministry of Commerce (MOFCOM) and State Administration of Traditional Chinese Medicine (SATCM), will take a new mode for the international expansion of TCM.

1.2 Weaknesses and threats

- **1.2.1 Cultural differences lead to heavy policy control and difficulties of market access.** Western countries only acknowledge Chinese acupuncture but not TCM physician accreditation for now. For example, acupuncture is permitted to be performed only by a western doctor but not by a TCM doctor. The diploma of TCM universities are not recognized in some countries, therefore difficulties occur for those graduates to get a job, which directly influence the development of TCM education.
- **1.2.2 TCM practitioners bear very different qualifications and competency.** Some, even not certified, TCM practitioners are offering services, leading to many medical malpractices with very negative impact, which are often taken as vivid examples to oppose TCM and severely damage TCM's image. To standardize the qualification, improve the overall capability, skills and academic competency of TCM practitioners is one of the biggest challenges facing TCM at the moment.
- 1.2.3 TCM has not yet been accepted as medical science. It is often questioned and denied even as a complementary and alternative medicine. In early 2012, a medical magazine published an article titled *Higher Education Institutions Should Not Run Pseudo Medical Courses*, trying to make an advantageous situation to cancel all complementary medical courses and degrees. More than 400 western medicine practitioners, medical researchers and scientists united as a very powerful and persuasive lobby group, putting pressure on some Australian universities and colleges to accelerate them in canceling alternative medicine courses and stop awarding related degrees. *America Today* published an article named *Alternative Medicine--Magic or Trick?* telling the story of a 12-year-old girl who developed acute pancreatitis because of taking various nutritious supplementary for a long time. The article thought that Chinese herbal medicine is just labeled as natural and green rather than actually being effective and harmless, and alternative treatment is just a blind common belief that being natural is all good.
- **1.2.4** The structure of TCM international trade is unreasonable, with material trade taking up the primary part. The trade volume of Chinese patent medicine reflects the international development of TCM. Therefore, to some degree, the export of Chinese patent medicine can be an important indicator of the internationalization of TCM. Take China as example, plant extract takes up the most in TCM export volume of 48.5% at 1.13 billion dollars; TCM materials and tablets is at 33%, ranking No. 2, with an export volume of 770 million dollars; Chinese patent medicine, 230 million dollars accounts for 9.9%.
- **1.2.5** There lacks TCM international standard to follow concerning TCM regulation or international market access negotiation. No matter it is within WTO multilateral trading systems or in the bilateral trading mechanisms under FTA, no international TCM standards can be referred to, which has been the main challenge for TCM internationalization.

2. The international situation and prospect of TCM

The internationalization of TCM is an inevitable trend. TCM will stride its way throughout the world, due to the following reasons:

Firstly, peace and development is a major trend for the moment. While countries are committed to economic development and improving people's livelihood, the demand for health care and treatment rises, necessitating developing medicine industry and promoting health care.

Secondly, with people's thought on health care and medical mode changing, core ideas such as "holistic view" "syndrome differentiation" "preventive treatment of disease" in TCM are gradually being recognized and accepted by the international community. In recently years, the characteristics and advantages that TCM enjoys in treating certain serious diseases are being recognized. Demand for TCM treatment is also on the rise in the world arena.

Thirdly, from the perspective of hygiene economics, TCM bears a series of advantages: it is green and natural, therefore good for health preservation and conducive to preventive treatment of disease; it is advantageous in preventing serious diseases and infectious diseases. It has incomparable advantages in treating chronic diseases. It is simpler, convenient and relatively less expensive to examine and to accept treatment, which could be an option when many developed countries in Europe and America with high welfare and correspondingly a heavy medical burden.

Fourthly, global aging has brought opportunities to TCM development. With thousands of years of development, TCM has accumulated rich experience and have witnessed good clinical effects in health care, rehabilitation and disease prevention. With the help of modern technology, remarkable achievements have been made in geriatrics; TCM has gained recognition in this regard from world geriatrics.

Finally, industrial development, modern stubborn diseases, drug-induced diseases, toxic and side effects of synthetic drug and the limitation of modern medicine have all provided opportunities for TCM development for it uses natural herbal materials and it takes effect with complicated interference.

3. Future goals and missions of WFCMS

There are short-term goals and long-term goals for the following 10-year goal of WFCMS. In the coming-up five to ten years, WFCMS will further strengthen its organization foundation, improve its brand image, enhance its current channels and continue to ensure service capability and build up international influence. We should set out to make WFCMS the TCM international academic organization with highest academic status, largest scope and greatest influence, thus making more contribution to the internationalization of TCM.

Since the combination of the economic globalization and information technology revolution, a series of profound economic and social changes have taken place, among which the emergence of global industrial chain is one of the biggest. Therefore, WFCMS will also grasp the opportunity of global industrial division when it comes to the internationalization of TCM, to formulate reasonable development strategies, positively take part in global division of international NGOs and try to build WFCMS the most influential international NGO. To realize these goals, our focus of WFCMS work would lie in the following aspects in the next 10 years:

- **3.1** Continue to enhance the academic status of TCM as a medical science in the international community and further accelerate the progress of TCM into health care systems in different countries. First of all, we should continue to promote exchanges and cooperation with other international organizations and governments. Then, we should improve communication and cooperation with other member countries to gradually establish a governmental exchange and cooperation dialogue. In the meantime, try to build correspondence and seek for project cooperation with other famous NGOs related to TCM (such as WWF, TRAFFIC, IUCN), thus winning more TCM supporters.
- 3.2 Strengthen WFCMS construction, develop education and training programs and continuously enhance TCM service capability. Based on further improvement of connection and cooperation among the current 234 members from 61 countries and regions, we will make more effort in educational training, accreditation tests, top masters tutoring promising doctors programs and TCM title appraisal and promoting practical TCM techniques so as to cultivate more talents. We will also propel TCM subject differentiation, make full use of the advantages of TCM in prevention and treatment of specific diseases and improve the overall quality and service ability of all of the practitioners. At the same time, we should encourage all member countries to support TCM education, including running regular TCM academic education and organizing all sorts of TCM training classes with a credit system, offering high-quality TCM services.
- **3.3 Promote high-level international technological cooperation and further improve international academic exchanges.** Encourage international technological cooperation between relevant groups in China with those scientific and research institutions, universities and pharmaceutical enterprises in other countries in theoretical and clinical researches and continuously enhance creativity. WFCMS will keep on with the building of a three-level international academic conference exchange platform and strengthen its academic competence, quality and the ability to organize international medical events with continuous brand building and increasing international influence.
- **3.4 Push forward building a TCM international standard and facilitate the trade of TCM products and services.** Based on the 10 existing international organization standards, WFCMS would intensify its effort in the

making, popularizing and using of its own standards. With more active communication, cooperation and coordination with other governments and TCM institutions, it should make good use of ISO and promote the use of the international standard of WFCMS. Encourage member countries to get involved in international registration of TCM and establish a TCM Trade and Services Committee, enhancing the strategic and market researches on TCM service trade and facilitating its the sustainable development.

3.5 Continue to vigorously promote the international communication of TCM culture and strengthen the "soft power" of traditional Chinese culture. We will further improve the quality of *World Chinese Medicine* and professional medical magazines published by other member countries, push forward publishing them in different languages and raising their international influence. Effort should also go to building and improving member institutions' websites and to accelerating cooperation between them and CCTV International channel in finishing the shooting of the full-length television documentary *TCM Going Global*. We will seek more cooperation with UNESCO in intangible cultural heritage consulting and actively take part in related activities. Organize itinerant exhibitions and science promotion activities on TCM in those member countries that are with good economic and TCM infrastructure with the help of World Conference on Traditional Chinese Medicine. Fully discover TCM cultural essence and charm and enhance its soft power.

In conclusion, to realize the long-term development goals of TCM, WFCMS will target at seeking health and happiness for all human beings and continuously strengthen its TCM service capability and quality, relying on extensive and profound TCM culture. It should also intensify its effort in digging more into the economic, societal, humanistic and practical values of TCM culture and learn experiences from other international NGOs while discovering its own strengths and position. Efforts should also be made in proactively participating in international NGOs' global division and strengthening its ability to make moves in international affairs, devoted to research on people's health. Advocating "green and natural" "environmental protection" and "ecological civilization", with the healthy concepts and attitude that "harmony between the heaven and human " "Tao imitate nature" "people-oriented" and "balanced harmony", WFCMS will spread and enhance the soft power of TCM culture. By continuously developing itself and progressively building itself into the most influential NGO, WFCMS will make continuously contribution to the international expansion of TCM as well as to the well-being and happiness of all human.